

MINUTES

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

Wednesday, December 9, 2009, at 9:30 a.m.

522 Kenneth Hahn Hall of Administration Los Angeles, California 90012

9:30 A.M. CLOSED SESSION

Consideration of the appointment, employment, evaluation of performance, discipline, or dismissal of public employees pursuant to Government Code Section 54957, for the positions listed below.

CONVENED THE MEETING AT 9:32 A.M. AND WENT INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 9:33 A.M.

10:00 A.M. AGENDA

RECONVENED THE MEETING AT 10:20 A.M.

<u>COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: ADKINS, FELTON, FOX, KAHWAJIAN</u>
<u>COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: MARTINEZ</u>

ANNOUNCED THAT THERE WILL NOT BE A MEETING THE FOLLOWING DATES: DECEMBER 23, AND DECEMBER 30, 2009.

Correction to the Minutes of the meeting of Wednesday, November 4, 2009, Item 21 (Case No. 07-529)
APPROVED.

Minutes of the meeting of Wednesday, December 2, 2009, for approval APPROVED.

Unfinished Business

1. Petition of **HECTOR ARCE** for a hearing on his **discharge**, effective March 18, 2009, from the position of Eligibility Worker II, Department of Public Social Services, **Case No. 09-1066**.

ANNOUNCED AS THE PROPOSED DECISION OF THE COMMISSION TO ACCEPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, CAROL VENDRILLO, TO DEEM THE PETITION WITHDRAWN PURSUANT TO CIVIL SERVICE RULE 4.08(B).

12/9/09 - 1 -

Unfinished Business (continued)

- Petition of SERA BOYADJIAN for a hearing on her non-appointment to the position of Deputy District Attorney IV and reassignment, based on her claim of a Civil Service Rule 25 violation, Case No. 05-213.
 ANNOUNCED AS THE PROPOSED DECISION OF THE COMMISSION TO ACCEPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, ANTHONY MILLER, TO DEEM THE PETITION WITHDRAWN PURSUANT TO CIVIL SERVICE RULE 4.08(B). COMMISSIONER KAHWAJIAN RECUSED HIMSELF.
- 3. Petition of **MOSES MUNOZ** for a hearing on his **discharge**, effective August 11, 2008, from the position of Eligibility Worker II, Department of Public Social Services, **Case No. 08-352**.

 ANNOUNCED AS THE PROPOSED DECISION OF THE COMMISSION TO ACCEPT THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, PHILIP TAMOUSH, TO SUSTAIN THE DEPARTMENT.
- 4. Petition of **ALEXIS SMITH** for a hearing on her fifteen (15) day **suspension**, effective May 23, 2005, from the position of Patient Resources Worker, Department of Health Services, LAC+USC Medical Center, **Case No. 05-185**.

 ANNOUNCED AS THE PROPOSED DECISION OF THE COMMISSION TO ACCEPT THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, IRENE P. AYALA, TO SUSTAIN THE DEPARTMENT.
- Petition of HELEN AGUIRRE for a hearing on her discharge, effective December 10, 2008, from the position of Data Conversion Equipment Operator II, Department of Treasurer and Tax Collector, Case No. 08-5003.
 RECEIVED AND FILED COMMUNICATION WITHDRAWING THE PETITION BASED ON A SETTLEMENT. HEARING CANCELLED.
- 6. Petition of **DALILA CALDERA** for a hearing on her **suspension** not to exceed thirty (30) days following judgment of a criminal matter, effective May 4, 2009, from the position of Eligibility Worker II, Department of Public Social Services, **Case No. 09-1227**.

 RECEIVED AND FILED COMMUNICATION WITHDRAWING THE PETITION. HEARING CANCELLED.
- 7. Petition of **VICTORIA GUTIERREZ** for a hearing on her fifteen (15) day **suspension**, effective July 23, 2008, from the position of Intermediate Typist Clerk, Department of Public Social Services, **Case No. 08-309**.

 RECEIVED AND FILED COMMUNICATION WITHDRAWING THE PETITION BASED ON A SETTLEMENT. HEARING CANCELLED.

12/9/09 - 2 -

Unfinished Business (continued)

- 8. Petition of **BARBARA REDD** for a hearing on her **discharge**, effective March 31, 2009, from the position of Eligibility Worker II, Department of Public Social Services, **Case No. 09-1086**.

 RECEIVED AND FILED COMMUNICATION WITHDRAWING THE PETITION. HEARING CANCELLED.
- Petition of ROSIE ROMERO for a hearing on her assignment in the position of Departmental Personnel Technician, Department of Health Services, Health Services Administration, based on her claim of a Civil Service Rule 25 violation, Case No. 05-160.
 RECEIVED AND FILED COMMUNICATION WITHDRAWING THE PETITION BASED ON A SETTLEMENT. HEARING CANCELLED.

New Business

- 10. Petition of **ROBIN EVANS** for a hearing on her ten (10) day **suspension**, effective October 13, 2009, from the position of Intermediate Clerk, Department of Public Social Services, **Case No. 09-1425**.

 HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.
- 11. Petition of **JORGE SANDATE** for a hearing on his ten (10) day **suspension**, effective October 5, 2009, from the position of Community Worker, Department of Mental Health, **Case No. 09-1426**.

 HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.
- 12. Petition of **GENEVA L. SMITH** for a hearing on her **suspension** not to exceed thirty (30) days pending investigation, effective September 25, 2009, from the position of Electrical Helper, Department of Health Services, LAC+USC Healthcare Network, **Case No. 09-1434**. HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.
- 13. Petition of **ROSA CUEVAS** for a hearing on her **discharge**, effective October 9, 2009, from the position of Children's Social Worker I, Department of Children and Family Services, **Case No. 09-1432**.

 HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.
- 14. Petition of **ERIC ESPEJO** for a hearing on his **discharge**, effective October 2, 2009, from the position of Fire Dispatcher I, Fire Department, **Case No. 09-1429**. HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.

12/9/09 - 3 -

New Business (continued)

- Petition of **DORIS FORREST** for a hearing on her **discharge**, effective September 30, 2009, from the position of Licensed Vocational Nurse I, Department of Health Services, Olive View-UCLA Medical Center, **Case No. 09-1422**.
 HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.
- 16. Petition of **JULIA MORA** for a hearing on her **discharge**, effective September 28, 2009, from the position of Children's Social Worker III, Department of Children and Family Services, **Case No. 09-1424**.

 HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.
- 17. Petition of **GAYLYN WATERS** for a hearing on her **discharge**, effective October 2, 2009, from the position of Nursing Attendant I, Department of Health Services, Harbor-UCLA Medical Center, **Case No. 09-1431**.

 HEARING GRANTED HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.
- Amended petition of WILLIAM L. WEST for a hearing on the Director of Personnel's denial of his appeal of the Appraisal of Promotability score received in the examination for Mental Health Analyst I, Case No. 09-1166. CONTINUED AT THE REQUEST OF BOTH PARTIES FOR FURTHER REVIEW BY THE DEPARTMENT.
- 19. Petition of **ALYCE DEVERS** for a hearing on her **medical release**, effective August 26, 2009, from the position of Transcriber Typist, Probation Department, **Case No. 09-1402**.

 CONTINUED IN ORDER FOR THE DEPARTMENT TO RECEIVE DOCUMENTATION REGARDING THE PETITIONER'S WORK RESTRICTIONS. (NO ONE APPEARED FOR THE PETITIONER.)

Miscellaneous

 Opportunity for members of the public to address the Commission on items of interest that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission.
 NO PUBLIC COMMENTS.

ADJOURNED TO CLOSED SESSION AT 10:30 A.M.

12/9/09 - 4 -

CLOSED SESSION

Consideration of confidential peace officer appeals pursuant to Copley Press.

Unfinished Business

- 21. Petitioner's request for a hearing on his ten (10) day **suspension**, effective February 22, 2005, from the position of Deputy Sheriff, Sheriff's Department, **Case No. 05-083**.

 OVER-RULED THE PETITIONER'S OBJECTIONS. THE COMMISSION ADOPTED, AS ITS FINAL DECISION, THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, JOAN CLAY MANLEY, TO SUSTAIN THE DEPARTMENT.
- 22. Petitioner's request for a hearing on his thirty (30) day suspension, effective September 16, 2006, from the position of Deputy Probation Officer II, Probation Department, Case No. 06-360.
 AFTER READING THE RECORD, THE COMMISSION OVER-RULED THE DEPARTMENT'S OBJECTIONS TO THE NEW PROPOSED DECISION AND ADOPTED AS ITS FINAL DECISION THE MODIFIED FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND PROPOSED DECISION OF AUGUST 5, 2009, NOT SUSTAINING THE DEPARTMENT IN THE SUSPENSION.
- 23. Petitioner's request for a hearing on his **discharge**, effective August 18, 2006, from the position of Transportation Deputy, Probation Department, **Case No. 06-354**.

 ANNOUNCED AS THE NEW PROPOSED DECISION OF THE COMMISSION TO ACCEPT FINDINGS OF FACT 3, 10, AND 11 OF THE SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER, RICHARD C. ANTHONY, BUT REJECTED THE CONCLUSION OF LAW AND FOUND THERE WAS NO SKELLY VIOLATION.
- 24. Petitioner's request for a hearing on his fifteen (15) day **suspension**, effective December 1, 2008, from the position of Transportation Deputy, Probation Department, **Case No. 08-5008**.

 RECEIVED AND FILED COMMUNICATION WITHDRAWING THE PETITION BASED ON A SETTLEMENT. HEARING CANCELLED.
- 25. Petitioner's request for a hearing on the Director of Personnel's denial of his appeal of the interview score and the Appraisal of Promotability score received in the examination for Lieutenant, Case No. 09-1171.
 WAIVED THE TIMELINESS ISSUE ON THE INTERVIEW SCORE. HEARING DENIED.

12/9/09 - 5 -

Unfinished Business (continued)

- 26. Petitioner's request for a hearing on the Director of Personnel's denial of her appeal of the interview score received in the examination for Lieutenant, Case No. 09-1088. HEARING DENIED.
- 27. Petitioner's request for a hearing on the Director of Personnel's denial of his appeal of the interview score received in the examination for Lieutenant, Case No. 09-1101. HEARING DENIED. (NO ONE APPEARED FOR THE PETITIONER.)
- 28. Petitioner's request for a hearing on the Director of Personnel's denial of his appeal of the interview score received in the examination for Lieutenant, Case No. 09-1107.

 HEARING DENIED. (NO ONE APPEARED FOR THE PETITIONER.)

New Business

29. Petitioner's request for a hearing on his **discharge**, effective September 4, 2009, from the position of Police Officer, City of Palos Verdes Estates, **Case No. 09-1400**. HEARING GRANTED – HEARING OFFICER TO BE ASSIGNED.

ADJOURNED CLOSED SESSION AND RECONVENED THE MEETING AT 11:44 A.M.

READ INTO THE RECORD AN ACCOUNTING OF ACTIONS TAKEN DURING CLOSED SESSION.

ADJOURNED THE MEETING AT 11:46 A.M.

Legal Advisor: Lester J. Tolnai

Deputy Executive Director: Sandy Stivers

12/9/09 - 6 -

Chief, Commission Services: Rochelle L. Williams

Head Commission Specialist: Janice Davis

APPROVED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON DECEMBER 16, 2009

Laurence D. Crocker

Lawrence D. Crocker Executive Director

12/9/09 - 7 -